

行政院國家科學委員會專題研究計劃成果報告

服務業人力資源管理、員工利他行為與顧客自發行為之關係探討

An Empirical Study of the Relationships Between Human Resource Management, Employee Prosocial Behaviors, and Customer Voluntary Performance in Service Industry

計劃編號: NSC 88-2416-H155-007

執行期限: 87 年 8 月 1 日至 88 年 7 月 31 日

主持人: 嚴秀茹 元智大學企管系

e-mail: hjyen@saturn.yzu.edu.tw

I. 中文摘要:

卓越的服務與顧客滿意度在今日服務業已逐漸受到重視。本計劃探討在工作當中付出額外的努力以協助組織與同事的組織公民行為，如何關係著組織的服務績效。此外，員工也可能將額外的心力放在顧客身上，表現顧客導向的利他行為。本研究探討此兩種利他行為之前置影響因素與其對組織服務績效之效應。本研究也將顧客納入為企業經營資源之概念，探討顧客自發行為之影響因素，並試由社會交換理論詮釋上述變數之關係。本研究以本國一銀行之全省分行行員、主管、及顧客為研究對象，共蒐集 515 位顧客與 260 位行員等 26 分行之資料。研究結果顯示員工的情緒相關感受最能夠預測其利他行為之表現，角色外的顧客導向之利他行為最能夠解釋組織的服務品質，組織公民行為則相對地影響有限。顧客對於企業本身及行員所抱持的種種評價也直接與間接透過關係品質影響顧客的自發行為之產生。本案亦對結果在服務業管理上之啟示予以探討。

關鍵字: 組織公民行為, 組織服務績效, 關係品質, 利他行為, 顧客導向, 服務品質, 顧客自發行為、社會交換理論

Abstract

This study examined the effects of employee and customer prosocial behavior in banking service industry. Antecedents and organizational outcome of employee prosocial behavior, including organizational citizenship behavior and customer service behavior, were examined. This study also

investigated customer voluntary performance (CVP) as a form of prosocial behavior exhibited in customer. A theoretical framework was proposed to explain the relationship among the variables from the perspective of social exchange theory. Data were collected from customers, employees, and supervisor in 26 branches of a bank in Taiwan. The results addressing research issues were mixed. Extra-role customer service behavior had a consistently positive relationship with service performance, while OCB did not predict most customer responses. Affect-related variable, such as affective commitment, POS, supports for customers, were the main influential variables on employee and customer prosocial behaviors. LISREL testing a sub-model for the antecedents of customer voluntary performance indicated a well-fitting results for the model, and suggested that customer evaluation of organizational characteristics and employees affected CVP directly and indirectly through the mediation of relationship quality.

Key words: OCB, service performance, relationship quality, prosocial behavior, customer-oriented service, service quality, customer voluntary performance, social exchange

II. Introduction:

Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) has been found to facilitate the occurrence of exceptional service performance (Hoffman &

Kelley, 1994). The contribution of OCB to organizational effectiveness seems to be a reasonable argument but empirical studies for the relationship between aggregated OCB and organizational-level performance indicators remains limited. Prosocial service behavior directed toward customers were rarely empirically investigated. This project investigated both types of employee prosocial behaviors, focusing on the antecedents and their relative contributions to organizational service performance.

Customers or clients have been considered as “partial” employees to maximize customers’ contribution (Barnard, 1948; Lovelock & Young, 1979; Mills, 1986). Customers act as partner of the firms may manifest customer voluntary performance (CVP). CVP refers to “helpful, discretionary behaviors of customers that support the ability of the firm to deliver service quality” (Bettencourt, 1997). Loyalty, cooperation, and participation are the three types of CVP examined in this study.

In summary, the current project studied (a) the relationship between OCB and organizational-level outcomes (b) the antecedents and the relative contribution of the two types of prosocial behaviors to organizational performance (c) the factors motivating CVP.

III. Literature Review

Contact employees are one key source of differentiation and competitive advantage in many service companies (Pfeffer, 1994). In specific, the attitude and behavior of contact employees have a great impact on customers satisfaction, evaluations of service quality, and loyalty to service providers (e.g., Keaveney, 1995; Schneider & Bowen, 1993). Front-line employees may enhance service excellence by creating positive image of the corporation or go beyond the call of their duty to help customers, and the extra-work of employees have been considered as prosocial behavior.

Prosocial Behavior OCB and prosocial customer service behavior were the two types of employee prosocial behavior studied in this project. OCBs refer to behaviors that employees are not explicitly rewarded for exhibiting nor punished for not exhibiting (Organ, 1988). Also, OCBs were not learned

from explicit job description and training. Organ (1988) proffers five dimensions of OCB, including altruism, sportsmanship, courtesy, conscientiousness, and civic virtue. According to Organ (1988), OCB has to be considered as an aggregated acts to improve the function of the organization. However, few studies have addressed this issue, and only two published studies (i.e., Podsakoff et al., 1997; Podsakoff & MacKenzie, 1994) have used an aggregated measure of OCB. This study used aggregated as well as individual-level measure.

Prosocial customer service behaviors (PCSB) included role-prescribed and extra-role customer services. Role-prescribed customer service refers to expected employees behaviors in serving the firm's customers (Brief & Motowidlo, 1986; Katz and Kahn, 1978). Employees may develop expectations for these behaviors from implicit norms in the workplace or from explicit obligation forms (Brief & Motowidlo, 1986; Puffer, 1987). Extra-role prosocial customer service behavior refers to discretionary behaviors of contact employees extended their job requirement to serve the customers (Bettencourt & Brown, 1997).

Antecedents of Prosocial Behavior

The current project proposed five organizational characteristics as potential antecedents of employee prosocial behavior, including empowerment, leader-member exchange, perceived organizational support, customer-orientation culture, and affective commitment.

Empowerment Psychological empowerment which indicates employees’ competence and self-determination is fundamental for providing satisfaction service. Psychological empowerment, defined by Conger and Kanungo (1988), Thomas and Velthouse (1990), is intrinsic motivation reflecting the individuals’ orientation to their work role, ought to predict the “capability” of prosocial behavior. Bowen & Lawler (1992) suggested that empowerment is able to enhance efficient responses to customers’ needs and to encourage innovative design for service, which improves service quality and organizational effectiveness.

Affective Commitment Affective commitment is defined as “an affective or emotional attachment to the organization such that the strongly committed individual identifies with, is involved in, and enjoys membership in, the organization” (Allen and Meyer, 1990). It is expected that employees with higher affective commitment to the organization would show a greater level of organization citizenship behavior and prosocial behavior toward customers.

Perceived Organizational Support Employees usually form a global belief concerning the extent to which the organization values their contribution and cares about their well-being, and this belief was labeled as perceived organization support -POS (Eisenberger, Huntington, Hutchison & Sowa, 1986). The perception of being supported by the organization normally creates a feeling of obligation to repay the organization and to support the organizational goal (Eisenberger et al., 1986). POS is predicted to positively correlate with both OCB and prosocial customer service behavior.

Leader-Member Exchange The exchange relationship between subordinates and their supervisors is labeled as “leader-member exchange” which explains why subordinates feel obligated to work for their supervisors beyond their employment contract. Supervisors offering valued benefits usually receive increasing help of subordinates on various tasks, as leader-member exchanges increase in quality (Graen & Scandura, 1987). This study examined whether this between individuals relationship lead to positive outcome at the organizational level.

Customer-Orientation Customer-orientation has been considered as one component of market-orientation (Han, Kim, & Srivastava, 1998; Narver & Slater, 1990). A practice of customer orientation requires the seller to understand a buyer’s entire value chain (Day & Wensley, 1988). This culture component is specially important for service firms because it encourages the employees to engage in behavior increasing customer satisfaction. A positive correlation between customer-orientation and prosocial behaviors, particular the ones directed toward customers.

Customer Voluntary Performance

Customer voluntary performance (CVP) proposed by Bettencourt in 1997 refers to the phenomenon that customers may contribute to the firms by playing their roles as a promoter, as human resource or co-producer, and as consultant of the organization. These roles are each associated with one category of customer voluntary performance, namely, loyalty, cooperation, and participation.

The first category of customer voluntary performance, loyalty, refers to the role of being promoters for the firms. In specific, customers show their loyalty by repeating purchase and spreading favorable word-of-mouth and recommendation (Rust, Zahorik, & Keiningham, 1995). The second category of customer voluntary performance, cooperation, occurs when the customers take the role of human resource or co-producer of the firms. In addition, customers may play the role of organization consultant, and exhibit the third category of voluntary performance - participation (Van Dyne et al., 1994). As a consultant, the customers are willing to provide suggestions or express their complaints to the firms, which is particularly valuable because of their unique position in the service process (Wolstenholme, 1988).

In sum, this study focused on the effects of employee prosocial behavior, customer perceived relationship quality, customer evaluation of the service organization, and service quality as antecedents. A theoretical model was proposed to explain the relationships between these variables.

IV. Research Methods:

Research Setting: Retail banking was selected for the current project because contact employees are of moderate important, customer performance expectations are moderate, employee contacts are low to moderate, and the service is provided on a discrete basis (cf. Bowen, 1990; Lovelock, 1983). Also, there are few inhibitions to switching service provides or voicing complaints and suggestions (Bowen, 1990; Singh, 1990).

Participants: Customer data were collected from the 26 branches of a commercial bank in Taiwan. There are a total of 515 customers,

260 employees participated this study as valid cases. The data collected from three different sources was described in the following sections.

Measures:

Measures for Customers

Customers were asked to report their responses on the following variables: (1) customer voluntary performance (CVP) which is composed of three sub-scales, loyalty, cooperation, and participation; (2) perceived service quality with five dimensions, tangibility, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy; (3) relationship quality with trust and satisfaction as two essences; (4) evaluation of service organization/employee including service expertise; contact intensity; supports for customers; and relationship benefits.

Measures for Supervisors

There were two assessment of prosocial behavior reported by the supervisors about their immediate employees: (a) OCB: This assessment included six sub-scales, altruism, civic virtue, sportsmanship, conscientiousness, voluntary learning, and organizational moral; (b) Prosocial customer service behavior: This assessment was composed of two sub-scales, role-prescribed and extra-role customer service behaviors.

Measures for Employees

There are five measure for employees, customer-orientation, affective commitment, empowerment, perceived organizational support (POS), Leader-member exchange (LMX). Among these measures, empowerment was composed of four different factors, "meaning", "competence", "self-determination", and "impact". These constructs were measured with five-point likert scale.

V. Results:

Scale Reliabilities The internal consistency for the measures ranging from .70 to .94, indicated the adequacy for subsequent analyses.

Main Results and Discussions

Prosocial Behaviors Toward the Organization and Customers The results regarding these issues were mixed. In general, providing

employee the feeling of being support by the organization and investment in development employee affective commitment seem to be the management focus to provoke more prosocial behavior among service employees. Also, the organizational characteristics studied in this study provided better understanding for prosocial customer service behavior than for OCB.

One important finding of the current study was that prosocial behavior toward customers were more predictive of customers responses than OCB, because more significant positive relationships were found between prosocial customer service behavior and service performance evaluated by customers. The findings provided crucial implication for service management.

Prosocial Behavior and CVP The findings did not provide a strong support for the exchange linkage between employee prosocial behavior and customer voluntary performance, but the results did suggest some antecedents about CVP. A sub-model explaining the relationship between customer evaluation of organizational characteristics and customer voluntary performance through the mediating effects of relationship quality was supported. That is, when customer hold a more favorable evaluation of the bank or the employees, the evaluation can improve their relationship quality with the bank, and subsequently increased the likelihood of performing positive social acts which served the organizational goals. Moreover, this study also found that prosocial customer service behavior, particularly extra-role PCSB, was positively correlated with customer evaluations of service expertise, supports for customer, and contact intensity. These results provide an indirect support for the linkage between prosocial behavior and customer voluntary performance.

Antecedents of CVP

As an exploratory testing of the proposed model, the results provided partial supports for the antecedent of CVP. The results showed that customer evaluation of the service organization/employees had a greater direct impact on CVP than the indirect impact through relationship quality. Despite the regression analyses showing that relationship

quality was more powerful predictors of CVP, an analysis of the model as a whole showed a somewhat different findings.

VI. Conclusions and Self-Evaluation:

Despite that both OCB and PCSB are prosocial behavior performed by contact employees, OCB directed toward the organization and colleagues seemed to produce less significant impacts on customer perception. It was possible that OCB might benefit one's colleagues and organization, but did not result to please the customers. This results suggested that developing the culture of prosocial behavior directed toward customers might be more important for the service organization in which customer responses were directly influenced by service employees. Finally, the findings regarding the direct and indirect influences of CEOC on CVP suggested the importance of managing customers' evaluation of the organization and employees.

One focus of this project has been shifted from human resource function to organizational factors, which is somewhat different from the original proposal. However, this project have investigated several important and innovative issues in service management and marketing field.

VI. References:

- [1] Allen, N. J. & Meyer, J. P. "The Measurement and Antecedents of Affective, Continuance, and Normative Commitment to the Organization," *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 1990, 3, 1-18.
- [2] Barnard, C. "Organization and Management." *Cambridge*, 1948, MA: Harvard University Press.
- [3] Bettencourt, Lance A. "Customer Voluntary Performance: Customers as Partners in Service Delivery," *Journal of Retailing*, 1997, 73(3), 383-406.
- [4] Bowen, John. "Development of a Taxonomy of Services to Gain Strategic Marketing Insights," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 1990, 18(Winter), 43-49.
- [5] Bowen, D. E., & Lawler, E. E. . "The Empowerment of Service Workers: What, Why, How and When?" *Sloan Management Review*, 1992, 33, 31-39.
- [6] Brief A. P. & Motowidlo, S. J. "Prosocial Organizational Behaviors," *Academy of Management Review*, 1986, 11(4), 710-725.
- [7] Bettencourt, L. A., & Brown, S. W. "Contact Employees: Relationships Among Workplace Fairness, Job Satisfaction and Prosocial Service Behaviors," *Journal of Retailing*, 1997, 73(1), 39-61.
- [8] Conger, J. A., & Kanungo, R. N. "The Empowerment Process: Integrating Theory and Practice," *Academy of Management Review*, 1988, 13, 471-482.
- [9] Day, G.S. and Robin Wensley "Assessing Advantage: A Framework for Diagnosing Competitive Superiority," *Journal of Marketing*, 1988, 52 (April), 1-20.
- [10] Eisenberger, R., Huntington, R., Hutchison, S., Sowa, D. "Perceived Organizational Support," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1986, 71(Aug): 500-507.
- [11] Graen, G.B., & Scandura, T. A. "Toward a Psychology of Dyadic Organizinl992g," In L.L. Cummings & B.M. Staw (Eds.), *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 1987, 9, 175-208. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.
- [12] Han, J. K., N. Kim and R. Srivastav. "Market Orientation and Organizational Performance: Is Innovation a Missing Link ? ", *Journal of Marketing*, 1998, 30-45.
- [13] Hoffman, K. D., & Kelley S. W. "The Influence of Service Provider Mood States on Prosocial Behaviorand Service Quality Assessments," In C. Whan Park and Daniel C. Smith(Eds.), *AMA Winter Educators' Proceedings. Chicago*, 1994, IL: American Marketing Association.
- [14] Katz, Daniel and Robert L. Kahn. "The Social Psychology of Organizations," *New York: John Wiley & Sons*, 1978.
- [15] Keaveney, S.M. "Customer Switching Behavior in Service Industries: An Exploratory Study," *Journal of Marketing*, 1995, 59(April), 71-82.
- [16] Lovelock, C.H., & Young, R. "Look to consumers to increase productivity," *Harvard Business Review*, 1979, 57(3),

- 168-178.
- [17] Lovelock, C. H. "Classifying Services to Gain Strategic Marketing Insights," *Journal of Marketing*, 1983, 47(Summer), 9-20.
- [18] Mills, P. "Managing service industries: Organization practices in a post industrial economy," *Cambridge*, 1986, MA: Balinger.
- [19] Narver, J. C. and S. F. Slater "The Effect of a Market Orientation on Business Profitability," *Journal of Marketing*, 1990, 54(October), 20-35.
- [20] Organ, D. W. "Organizational citizenship behavior: The good soldier syndrome." *Lexington*, 1988, MA: Lexington Books.
- [21] Pfeffer, Jeffrey. "Competitive Advantage Through People: Unleashing the Power of the Work Force," *Boston: Harvard Business School Press*, 1994.
- [22] Podsakoff, P. M., Ahearne, M., & MacKenzie, S. B. "Organizational Citizenship Behavior and the Quantity and Quality of Work Group Performance," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1997, 82, 262-270.
- [23] Podsakoff, P. M., & MacKenzie, S. B. "Organizational Citizenship Behavior and Sales Unit Effectiveness," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 1994, 31, pp. 351-363.
- [24] Puffer, Sheila M. "Prosocial Behavior, Noncompliant Behavior, and Work Performance Among Commission Salespeople," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1987, 72 (November), 615-621.
- [25] Rust, R. T., A. J. Zahorik, and T. L. Keiningham "Return on Quality ROQ : Making Service Quality Financially Accountable," *Journal of Marketing*, 1995, 59(April), 58-70.
- [26] Schneider, B., & Bowen, D.E. "The Service Organization: Human Resource Management Is Crucial. Organizational Dynamics," 1993, 21 (Spring), 39-52.
- [27] Singh, J. "Voice, Exit, and Negative Word-of-Mouth Behaviors: An Investigation Across Three Service Categories," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 1990, 18(Winter), pp.1-15
- [28] Thomas, K. W., & Velthouse, B. A. "Cognitive elements of empowerment: An 'interpretive' model of intrinsic task motivation," *Academy of Management Review*, 15, 666-681.
- [29] Van Dyne, L., Graham, J. W., & Dienesch, R. M. "Organizational citizenship behavior: Construct redefinition, measurement, and validation," *Academy of Management Journal*, 1994, 37, 765-802.
- [30] Wolstenholme, S.M.(1988) "The Consultant Customer-A New Use for the Customer in Service Operations," *The Management of Service Operations: Proceedings of the Operations Management Association*, 1988, 195-203. 1992